Robust Gapless Surface State against Surface Magnetic Impurities on (Bi$_{0.5}$Sb$_{0.5}$)$_2$Te$_3$ Evidenced by In Situ Magnetotransport Measurements

Liuqi Yu, Longqian Hu, Jorge L. Barreda, Tong Guan, Xiaoyue He, Kehui Wu, Yongqing Li, and Peng Xiong

1Department of Physics, Florida State University, Tallahassee, Florida 32306, USA
2Beijing National Laboratory for Condensed Matter Physics, Institute of Physics, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Beijing 100190, China
3Songshan Lake Materials Laboratory, Dongguan, Guangdong 523808, China

(Received 21 August 2019; accepted 28 February 2020; published 24 March 2020)

Despite extensive experimental and theoretical efforts, the important issue of the effects of surface magnetic impurities on the topological surface state of a topological insulator (TI) remains unresolved. We elucidate the effects of Cr impurities on epitaxial thin films of (Bi$_{0.5}$Sb$_{0.5}$)$_2$Te$_3$: Cr adatoms are incrementally deposited onto the TI held in ultrahigh vacuum at low temperatures, and in situ magnetoconductivity and Hall effect measurements are performed at each increment with electrostatic gating. In the experimentally identified surface transport regime, the measured minimum electron density shows a nonmonotonic evolution with the Cr density ($n_{Cr}$): it first increases and then decreases with $n_{Cr}$. This unusual behavior is ascribed to the dual roles of the Cr as ionized impurities and electron donors, having competing effects of enhancing and decreasing the electronic inhomogeneities in the surface state at low and high $n_{Cr}$, respectively. The magnetoconductivity is obtained for different $n_{Cr}$ on one and the same sample, which yields clear evidence that the weak antilocalization effect persists and the surface state remains gapless up to the highest $n_{Cr}$, contrary to the expectation that the deposited Cr should break the time-reversal symmetry and induce a gap opening at the Dirac point.

DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevLett.124.126601

Distinct from ordinary band insulators, a three-dimensional (3D) topological insulator (TI) has a topologically protected surface state characterized by Dirac band dispersion and a helical spin texture [1–8]. Protected by time-reversal symmetry, the surface states (SSs) of TIs are robust against weak nonmagnetic perturbations and may even be immune from Anderson localization. In contrast, the exchange coupling between the localized magnetic moments and surface electrons breaks time-reversal symmetry and is expected to open a gap at the Dirac point [1,2,9]. The helical gap hosted by the topological SSs has been associated with a number of predictions of exotic quantum phenomena [10,11]. In principle, the most straightforward way for the introduction of SS gap and experimental realization of the predicted effects is via doping of magnetic impurities (MIs). One of the most remarkable examples is the successful realization of the quantum anomalous Hall effect (QAHE) in transition metal-doped TIs, e.g., Cr or V doped into the bulk of (Bi,Sb)$_2$Te$_3$ films in epitaxial growth [12–14]. Ferromagnetic ordering and resulting gap opening are observed in narrow ranges of doping concentrations and QAHE emerges when the Fermi level is tuned into the induced gap. Despite the success, the microscopic mechanism for the MI-induced surface gap remains inconclusive [15–29]. In contrast to bulk doping, both the experimental and theoretical situations with surface MI doping of TIs are far more uncertain. Early angle-resolved photoemission spectroscopy (ARPES) experiments [23] appeared to indicate that deposition of Fe impurities on the surface of Bi$_2$Se$_3$ induces a gap opening at the Dirac point of the SS. However, more recent ARPES measurements [24,27] showed a surprisingly robust SS of Bi$_2$Se$_3$ without any measurable gap opening at significant amount of Fe impurities on the surface. This is surprising in that in comparison to the insulating bulk, the conducting SS should be more conducive to mediating long-range ferromagnetic ordering. These observations have led to theoretical proposals [30–32] suggesting that the strong potential from MIs produces electronic states near the Dirac point which could fill the magnetically induced gap.

Experimentally, an effective quantitative probe of the magnetic effects of the MIs is magnetotransport measurements of the weak antilocalization (WAL) effect. The WAL, in the form of a negative magnetoconductance (MC) at low fields, can be analyzed in the model of Hikami-Larkin-Nagaoka (HLN) [33], which, in TIs, depends on the spin-flip scattering of the surface electrons as well as their interactions with the bulk [34–37]. A straightforward expectation from the theory is that when a TI is doped with MIs, the WAL should be suppressed and may even transition to weak localization [38]. However, the suppression of WAL was observed only in Bi$_2$Te$_3$ thin films deposited with Fe impurities [18]. There are two main experimental complications. One is the presence of bulk carriers and their interaction with the MIs. These material
and device issues may be addressed by means of chemical doping [4, 39–42] and electrostatic gating [35–37, 43–45]. Another notable source of uncertainty is that different levels of doping are realized in different samples, making it difficult to precisely determine the MI concentration dependence of any measured quantity from a large number of separate devices.

We therefore conduct measurements on (Bi$_{0.5}$Sb$_{0.5}$)$_2$Te$_3$ thin films which tends to have more insulating bulk than Bi$_2$Te$_3$ and Bi$_2$Se$_3$ [40, 41, 43] so as to provide a well isolated top SS for evaluating the effects of deposited MI. As evidenced by both the Hall effect (HE) and MC measurements, the electron transport can be tuned to the surface-dominated regime by electrostatic gating. For the MI deposition, we employed a technique of in situ quench condensation onto the top surface of a TI held at cryogenic temperatures [46–48]. Cr adatoms were deposited in controlled increments, and after each deposition a full set of measurements of ambipolar field effect and WAL was performed on one and the same sample. The setup therefore eliminates sample-to-sample variation and any air exposure between MI depositions. The results enable us to identify the effects of the Cr impurities on the top SS and their evolution with the Cr density n$_{Cr}$. WAL was found to persist up to the highest n$_{Cr}$, and its analysis suggests absence of any gap opening in the SS. We emphasize that the conclusion is solid even if there was some surface degradation from the initial air exposure, since we relied on the evolution of the HE and MC with n$_{Cr}$ in the same sample.

The TI samples were epitaxial (Bi$_{0.5}$Sb$_{0.5}$)$_2$Te$_3$ thin films grown on SrTiO$_3$ (111) substrates (300 μm thick) by molecular beam epitaxy [43]. The thin films were patterned into a Hall bar by ion milling with a shadow mask. A backgate was thermally evaporated onto the back of the SrTiO$_3$ substrate (see Supplemental Material, S1 [49], which includes Ref. [50]). The Cr deposition is done by resistive heating of a NiCr wire at fixed current. Verification of the deposition of Cr and its possession of a magnetic moment and calibration of its (relative) density were performed through separate measurements of suppression of the superconducting T$_C$ of ultrathin Pb films [46–48] (see Supplemental Material, S2 [49], which includes Refs. [47, 48]). The Cr adatoms thus deposited unambiguously possess magnetic moment and there is effective spin exchange scattering. In the following, the Cr density is indicated by the cumulative deposition time in seconds.

For as-grown (Bi$_{0.5}$Sb$_{0.5}$)$_2$Te$_3$, the Dirac point of the SS is in close proximity to the top of the bulk valence band [40, 41]. Electrostatic gating is used to tune the chemical potential and attain a state of surface-dominated transport. An indication of effective tuning of the chemical potential is the observation of ambipolar field effect, which is evidenced in the Hall effect [Fig. 1(a)] for a 15 nm thick (Bi$_{0.5}$Sb$_{0.5}$)$_2$Te$_3$ thin film (inset of Fig. 1(a)] with varying V$_G$. The Hall curves show varying degrees of nonlinearities over the gating range, indicating significant differences in the carrier densities and/or mobilities of the two SSs. In Figs. 1(b) and 1(c), we plot the zero-field Hall coefficient R$_{H}(0)$ and (c) corresponding sheet resistance R$_{ss}$, with varying V$_G$.

![FIG. 1. Ambipolar field effect measured on a 15 nm thick (Bi$_{0.5}$Sb$_{0.5}$)$_2$Te$_3$ epitaxial film on SrTiO$_3$ (111). The measurement temperature T = 500 mK. (a) Hall resistivity curves at selected V$_G$'s. Inset: Optical image of the patterned TI device. The red scale bar measures 300 μm. (b) Zero-field Hall coefficient R$_{H}(0)$ and (c) corresponding sheet resistance R$_{ss}$, with varying V$_G$.](image-url)
Because of electric screening, the backgate should have much diminished modulation of the top SS. The chemical potential is located close to the Dirac point of the top SS without any gating, and the surface-dominated transport regime can be reached by a positive $V_G$.

To identify the surface transport regime, a complementary and more rigorous method is to analyze the WAL effect [35,36], as shown in Fig. 3(a) for selected $V_G$'s. Quantitatively, $\Delta \sigma$ can be described by the simplified HLN equation:

$$\Delta \sigma(B) = \sigma(B) - \sigma(0) = \alpha \frac{e^2}{2\pi^2\hbar} \left[ \ln \frac{B_\phi}{B} - \psi \left(\frac{1}{2} + \frac{B_\phi}{B}\right) \right], \quad \text{(2)}$$

where $B$ is the applied magnetic field, $\hbar$ is Planck’s constant, and $\psi$ is the digamma function. $B_\phi$ is defined as the dephasing field. $\alpha$ is a fitting parameter, which can serve as a measure of the channel separation: $\alpha$ is equal to 0.5 for a single 2D channel. It has been established [35–37,51,52] that in a TI the top and bottom SSs can be decoupled by electrostatic gating: with varying $V_G$, $\alpha$ can change from 0.5 to approximately 1, which is interpreted as a signature of the transition from a single transport channel (coupled top and bottom surfaces via a conducting bulk) to two independent channels (insulating bulk and decoupled top and bottom surfaces). As shown in Fig. 3(b), the SS-dominated transport regime is identified at $V_G$'s where $\alpha$ reaches maximum (closest to 1). Small
FIG. 4. (a) Electron densities at selected $V_G$'s with increasing Cr density for the same sample. $V_G = +10, +50, \text{ and } +50 \text{ V}$ are close to the surface transport regime. $V_G = +200 \text{ V}$ serves as a reference showing the effect of electron doping by the Cr impurities. The black solid line marks the minimum electron density ($n_{\text{min}}$) identified at each $n_{\text{Cr}}$, (b) and (c) $B_\phi$ from fittings of the MC data to the HLN equation at selected $V_G$'s as functions of Cr density.

deviation of $\alpha$ from 1 can be caused by any asymmetry in the top and bottom surfaces even when they are decoupled [53], as is evident in Fig. 2. The variation of $B_\phi$ with gate voltage is shown in Fig. 3(c). $B_\phi$ shows a sharp drop from the hole to electron transport.

Figure 4(a) shows carrier densities of the same sample upon in situ incremental Cr deposition at selected $V_G$'s. In the decoupled regime, we assume that the bottom SS is not subject to the influence of the Cr impurities. The change of the overall electron density is then attributed to the top surface. The effect of electron doping of the Cr adatoms on the top surface is apparent at $V_G = +200 \text{ V}$, where the electron density increases monotonically with $n_{\text{Cr}}$. In the vicinity of the surface transport regime, the evolution of the carrier density is more complex. For each $n_{\text{Cr}}$, we identify a minimum electron density $n_{\text{min}}$, which is indicated by the black solid line in Fig. 4(a), $n_{\text{min}} = -1/\epsilon R_{H,\text{max}}(0)$, where $R_{H,\text{max}}(0)$ is the maximum Hall coefficient at a particular $n_{\text{Cr}}$ in the entire gating range. An example of $R_{H,\text{max}}(0)$ at $n_{\text{Cr}} = 0 \text{ s}$ is indicated by the black dashed line in Fig. 1(b). $n_{\text{min}}$ thus determined shows a nonmonotonic dependence on the Cr density. $n_{\text{min}}$ thus determined increases initially with $n_{\text{Cr}}$, and then decreases and approaches a constant upon further increase of $n_{\text{Cr}}$. The nonmonotonic dependence of $n_{\text{min}}$ on $n_{\text{Cr}}$ is not expected from carrier doping of an electronically homogeneous system, as exemplified by the $V_G = +200 \text{ V}$ state. Instead, this can be understood as a result of the electronic inhomogeneities in the SS in the form of electron-hole puddles near the Dirac point [44,56,57]. In the dilute limit, the Cr primarily serve as charged impurities, which increase local potential fluctuations. The increasing ionized impurity scattering can be characterized by increasing $n_{\text{min}}$. This effect of Coulomb scattering has been observed in both graphene [58,59] and TI [44]. At higher Cr densities, the SS becomes electrically more homogeneous, the local potential fluctuations diminish, and consequently $n_{\text{min}}$ decreases. In our experiments, $n_{\text{min}}$ reaches a maximum at $n_{\text{Cr}} = 600 \text{ s}$, which we surmise is the percolation threshold for a homogeneous Cr-doped top SS. This is consistent with the top SS initially being close to the Dirac point and with a proliferation of electron-hole puddles, similar to the reported results from transport measurements on Bi$_2$Se$_3$ thin films [44] and STM measurements on Bi$_2$Te$_3$ and Bi$_2$Se$_3$ doped with Ca or Mn impurities [56].

Figures 4(b) and 4(c) show the results from the analysis of the MC data in the framework of WAL at varying Cr densities, through which we examine the magnetic role of the Cr impurities. (See Supplemental Material, S6, for the data at selected $V_G$'s with increasing Cr densities [49].) In the surface transport regime ($V_G = +10$ and $+30 \text{ V}$), $\alpha$ stays close to 1 [see Fig. 4(b)], even at the highest Cr densities. This is strong evidence that both SSs remain gapless in the (large) range of $n_{\text{Cr}}$ studied, since an $\alpha$ of 0.5 is expected with a gapped top surface when the chemical potential is tuned to be positioned within the gap. Interestingly, $\alpha$ at the two opposite ends of the gating range, $V_G = +200$ and $-200 \text{ V}$, show opposite trends with changing $n_{\text{Cr}}$. This is consistent with the effect of electron doping for states as depicted in Fig. 2: At $V_G = +200 \text{ V}$ [Fig. 2(g)], the electron doping pushes the chemical potential further away from the Dirac point toward the bulk conduction band, leading to a decrease of $\alpha$ due to increased surface-bulk coupling and/or top-bottom surface asymmetry; at the opposite end at $V_G = -200 \text{ V}$ [Fig. 2(h)], the electron doping from the deposited Cr raises the chemical potential above the valence band into the surface transport regime for the top surface, leading to an increase of $\alpha$. In contrast, in the surface-transport-dominated regime ($V_G = +10$ and $+30 \text{ V}$), $\alpha$ stays close to 1 and shows little variation with $n_{\text{Cr}}$. This observation ($\alpha \approx 1$) in the clearly identified surface transport states provides compelling evidence that WAL persists up to the highest $n_{\text{Cr}}$.

Figure 4(c) shows the resulting dephasing field $B_\phi$ from the same fittings. With significant electronic inhomogeneity or multiple channels of transport, as exemplified by the case of $V_G = -200 \text{ V}$, the $B_\phi$ thus determined shows pronounced scatter and may not even be physically meaningful. A more interesting case is that of $V_G = +10 \text{ V}$, where $B_\phi$ initially shows large fluctuations but becomes well defined above $n_{\text{Cr}} = 600 \text{ s}$. This is in excellent agreement with the picture of the evolution of the electronic states inferred from $n_{\text{min}}$ in Fig. 4(a); namely, increasing $n_{\text{Cr}}$ drives the top SS from an inhomogeneous state characterized by electron-hole puddles to a state of uniform electron transport.

Finally, we comment on the origin and implications of the robustness of the gapless SS against surface paramagnetic
impurities. The persistence of WAL and absence of a transition from WAL to weak localization indicates no gap opening in the SS despite a significant amount of MIs. Long-range ferromagnetic order is often considered necessary for a gapped SS [9]. Unlike in the insulating bulk MIs, long-range ferromagnetic order is often considered necessary for a gapped SS [9]. Unlike in the insulating bulk MIs, our experiments suggest the persistence of WAL and absence of a magnetic dopants [9]. However, our experiments suggest the absence of any long-range ferromagnetic order in the top SS in a broad range of surface magnetic dopant densities.

In summary, using a unique experimental scheme combining incremental low-temperature deposition of magnetic impurities and in situ magnetotransport measurements on one and the same TI sample, we have obtained a detailed close look at the evolution of the topological SS with increasing MI density. The insight gleaned from these experiments would have been extremely difficult, if not impossible, from conventional experiments of measuring many samples at different doping levels. The roles of the Cr as electron donors, ionized impurities, and magnetic impurities are identified. Most notably, the Cr impurities are found to have very limited effect on the SS, as evidenced by the remarkable insensitivity of the WAL effect to $n_{CI}$ in a well-isolated topological SS.

P.X. acknowledges the support by the DARPA TEE Program (Cooperative Agreement No. D18AC00010) and NSF Grant No. DMR-1905843. The work at IOP is supported by the Priority Research Program of Chinese Academy of Sciences (Project No. 61425015), National Key Research and Development Program (Project No. 2016YFA0300600), and the Strategic Priority Research Program of Chinese Academy of Sciences (Project No. XDB28000000).

*pxiong@fsu.edu